



**Outcomes & Assessment Committee
Meeting Minutes**

October 25, 2021 • 3:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.

Zoom: <https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/93388060183>

Members

Name	Representing	Present	Absent
Dave Beymer	Faculty (PE/Kinesiology)	X	
Brook Foley	Faculty (Counseling)	X	
Angela Clark	Faculty (Nursing)	X	
Guy Hanna	Classified (LLS&R)	X	
Sachiko Matsunaga	Dean (L&LSR)	X	
Liz Morales	Faculty (Business)	X	
Cheryl O'Donnell	Faculty (Business, CSS)	X	
Johnny Perez	Faculty (Math)	X	

Guests

Name	Representing	Present	Absent

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 3:08 p.m. by Cheryl O'Donnell. Meeting was conducted via Zoom due to the shelter-in-place order.

ACTION ITEMS:

1. **Approval of Agenda:** The 10.25.2021 agenda was approved as written.
2. **Approval of Minutes:** Minutes for the 10/11/21 meeting were approved.

INFORMATION/DISCUSSION/PRESENTATIONS

3. Indiana University – [2021 Assessment Conference Pre-Recorded Sessions](#)

- a. Cheryl shared that she, Guy, and Liz were attending the Assessment Institute hosted by the University of Indiana. The conference is taking place from October 24 – 27. Since many of the committee members were unable to meet the registration deadline, Cheryl asked that each member choose one of the 82 [pre-recorded sessions](#) that are available to watch and then bring a 5 minute summary of that session to the next meeting. They have pre-recorded presentations from a variety of community colleges both within and outside of California. In addition, there are 4-year universities from our CSU and UC systems.

HARTNELL COLLEGE VISION STATEMENT

Hartnell College will be nationally recognized for the success of our students by developing leaders who will contribute to the social, cultural, and economic vitality of our region and the global community.

HARTNELL COLLEGE MISSION STATEMENT

Focusing on the needs of the Salinas Valley, Hartnell College provides educational opportunities for students to reach academic goals in an environment committed to student learning, achievement and success.

4. Graduate Survey Results

- a. Cheryl presented a summary of core competency graduate survey results ranging from 2019 – 2021. College. Survey results were presented in a spreadsheet format. There were separate worksheets for each of the six core competencies that showed both the number of responses for each prompt as well as the % of responses that indicated Agree or Somewhat Agree for each prompt. There were four prompts for each competency. She then shared a summary worksheet that presented overall percentages for students who indicated agree or somewhat agree for each competency. Cheryl indicated that she has results going back as far as 2012 when the surveys were first administered. However, questions and methodology of administering the survey changed over the years. The survey used to be done live at the graduation rehearsal. When the graduation ceremony moved to the Rabo Stadium, the survey was moved to an electronic format. While we do have six core competencies, we only have three years of data for five of them. This was due to an oversight that occurred when the survey was altered in 2018 to only focus on the aesthetic analysis prompts as well as a written essay prompt. When the full survey resumed in 2019, the prompts for Inquiry and Reason were inadvertently left off. This happened again in 2020 when the oversight was not caught due to COVID transitioning. The 2021 survey included all 24 prompts for the six competencies and future surveys will continue to do so. Cheryl mentioned that we should have time to gather enough years of results to develop the ability to analyze trend lines before the next accreditation visit in spring of 2026. Some observations made by the committee regarding the data included:

- Regardless of the disparity in the number of responses (in 2019 there were only 76 responses compared to 200+ in 2020 and 2021) the percentages reflected for Agree and Somewhat Agree were very close for almost all of the core competencies. Guy stated that this reflects well on the survey instrument itself.
- There was a downward trend in Information Competency over the three years. It was stated that this may be due to the fact that the library was closed during COVID semesters; therefore, access to librarians and research support was not as readily available and perhaps this impacted students.
- Even though there was only 2021 data available for the Inquiry and Reason competency, Cheryl was able to go back to previous survey results and pull data from 2016 and 2017. While the prompts were slightly different regarding this particular core competency, the overall results were still very close. (see data on next page)
- Aesthetic Analysis and Application continued to be the lowest scoring of the six core competencies as it was in previous iterations prior to the changing of the prompts in 2018.

HARTNELL COLLEGE VISION STATEMENT

Hartnell College will be nationally recognized for the success of our students by developing leaders who will contribute to the social, cultural, and economic vitality of our region and the global community.

HARTNELL COLLEGE MISSION STATEMENT

Focusing on the needs of the Salinas Valley, Hartnell College provides educational opportunities for students to reach academic goals in an environment committed to student learning, achievement and success.

In addition to looking at the quantitative data, Cheryl showed qualitative data for questions that were asked of students. There were two questions:

1. What class/es had the most impact on your college experience at Hartnell?
2. Please give us any suggestions or comments that can help us to improve teaching and learning for future generations of Hartnell graduates.

Guy will be summarizing the qualitative responses and will present at the next meeting.

3-Year Summary

	Spring 2019	Spring 2020	Spring 2021
Global			
Engagement	89.80%	91.23%	88.50%
Personal Growth	92.44%	93.53%	93.51%
Aesthetic Analysis and Application	80.00%	81.90%	83.10%
Communication	91.11%	91.65%	90.53%
Information Competency	97.06%	95.80%	94.83%
Inquiry and Reason			93.50%
Inquiry and Reason	2016 92%	2017 92%	2021.00% 93.50%

5. Value Rubrics – Continuing the Work

- a. Cheryl reviewed the O & A Value Rubrics Project with new members of the committee. She provided a review of how Guy Hanna created a cross walk of the AAC&U Value with our core competencies. This cross-walk document was used to define the starting points for building our own set of rubrics.

Cheryl went to the Google Drive and shared the rubrics that have been worked on by the committee. The only value rubric considered to be complete is the one for Aesthetics. All of the others have had work done to them to varying degrees. While work needs to be continued in terms of defining criteria for each ranking (Capstone to Benchmark) the elements to be assessed (contained in the left column of each rubric) were approved at the November 9, 2020 O & A meeting.

While reviewing the various work that has been done to date on the rubrics, Angela commented that she likes the column ranking headings that are used on the Aesthetic Analysis rubric. Instead of using Capstone, Milestones, and Benchmark

HARTNELL COLLEGE VISION STATEMENT

Hartnell College will be nationally recognized for the success of our students by developing leaders who will contribute to the social, cultural, and economic vitality of our region and the global community.

HARTNELL COLLEGE MISSION STATEMENT

Focusing on the needs of the Salinas Valley, Hartnell College provides educational opportunities for students to reach academic goals in an environment committed to student learning, achievement and success.

The rubrics for the Communication Core Competency still need to be visited in terms of finalizing the written communication rubric and creating a rubric for oral communication and the other forms that are referenced in the CC language. It has not yet been decided if there will be actual separate rubrics for the various types of communication or one overall rubric that breaks down by category.

A discussion on the overall timeline for implementing the value rubrics took place. It is unclear at this point, as to when the value rubrics will be rolled out to be used for assessment of our GE program and our core competencies. There is the ability to use eLumen and the mapping of courses to core competencies to pull data that can be examined. However, the data being entered at the course level does not use a common rubric to score the learning. Cheryl expressed that we are probably looking more long term before we fully implement the use of rubrics. She said that time is needed to work with the faculty who teach GE courses. It will be important to have buy in from the faculty. In addition, these rubrics will be potentially used by the curriculum committee as part of the GE course approval process.

Cheryl stated that the details of how these rubrics will be used will be included in the assessment plan.

The conversation briefly turned to discussion on the new accreditation standards that are being developed by the ACCJC. Dave Beymer is a member of one of the Commission's writing teams. He mentioned that it has been stated that as the standards are rewritten, they should keep in mind that a student should be able to read the standard and understand what it means. Cheryl mentioned that the same is true for SLOs and PLOs. As changes come about with work that is being done around equity and as the Presidential Task Force recommendations are brought forward, we might have an opportunity, as faculty, to rethink and rewrite our SLOs.

6. Non-Instructional PPA Questions

- a. Dave shared with the committee the non-instructional PPA questions for this year. Of the six questions, two of them are repeats from previous years. The other four questions are new and are more equity based. Cheryl suggested that for question 6 it might want to reference both qualitative and quantitative data. The questions are open ended in nature. Resource requests that are equity based will be highlighted.

7. SLOs and CurricUNET Review

- a. The committee reviewed all of the SLOs for the following courses and made recommendations as appropriate:

NVN 130B
NVN 139C

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting concluded at 5:00 p.m.

NEXT MEETING(S): November 8, 2021

HARTNELL COLLEGE VISION STATEMENT

Hartnell College will be nationally recognized for the success of our students by developing leaders who will contribute to the social, cultural, and economic vitality of our region and the global community.

HARTNELL COLLEGE MISSION STATEMENT

Focusing on the needs of the Salinas Valley, Hartnell College provides educational opportunities for students to reach academic goals in an environment committed to student learning, achievement and success.